NOTICE: this is the author's version of a work that was accepted for publication in Water Research. A definitive version was subsequently published in *Water Research* **64**, 42-52, 2014.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.06.034>

Phosphorus in soil treatment systems: accumulation and mobility

David Eveborn^{*,a,b}, Jon Petter Gustafsson^{a,c}, Elin Elmfors^b, Lin Yu^d, Ann-Kristin Eriksson^c, Emelie Ljung^b, Gunno Renman^a

^a *Division of Land and Water Resources Engineering, Royal Institute of Technology, Teknikringen 76, SE-100 44 Stockholm, Sweden*

^b *JTI - Swedish Institute of Agricultural and Environmental Engineering, Box 7033, S-750 07 Uppsala, Sweden*

^c *Department of Soil and Environment, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Box 7014, S-750 07 Uppsala, Sweden*

^d *Present address. Centre for Environmental and Climate Research (CEC), Lund University, SE-22362 Lund, Sweden*

^{*} *Corresponding author. Tel.: +46 8 790 73 28, E-mail address: eveborn@kth.se*

Abstract

Septic tanks with subsequent soil treatment systems (STS) are a common treatment technique for domestic wastewater in rural areas. Phosphorus (P) leakage from such systems may pose a risk to water quality (especially if they are located relatively close to surface waters). In this study, six STS in Sweden (11 to 28 years old) were examined. Samples taken from the unsaturated subsoil beneath the distribution pipes were investigated by means of batch and column experiments, and accumulated phosphorus were characterized through X-ray absorption near edge structure (XANES) analysis. At all sites the wastewater had clearly influenced the soil. This was observed through decreased pH, increased amounts of oxalate extractable metals and at some sites altered P sorption properties. The amount of accumulated P in the STS were found to be between 0.32 and 0.87 kg m⁻³, which in most cases was just a fraction of the estimated P load (< 30%). Column studies revealed that high P concentrations (up to 6 mg L⁻¹) were leached from the material when deionized water was applied. However, the response to deionized water varied between the sites. As evidenced by XANES analysis, aluminium phosphates or P adsorbed to aluminium (hydr)oxides, as well as organically bound P, were important sinks for P. Generally soils with a high content of oxalate-extractable Al were also less vulnerable to P leakage.

1 Introduction

Phosphorus (P) discharge from anthropogenic sources is a crucial factor for eutrophication of many inland aquatic systems worldwide (Smith, 2003). In most areas, agricultural activities are believed to account for the majority of the P discharge on an annual basis (e. g. Smith et al., 2005; Brandt et al., 2009) . The contribution from onsite wastewater treatment systems

(OWTs) is smaller but they can still be a relevant P source, especially in areas such as the Baltic sea region where the reduction of P loads is of high priority (Boesch et al., 2006; Wulff et al., 2007)

Among OWTs, the use of septic tanks with subsequent soil treatment systems (STS) is the most predominant treatment technique for domestic wastewater. The use of STS is extensive in rural parts of Australia, North America, Canada and parts of Europe in rural areas (Butler & Payne, 1995; USEPA, 2002; Beal et al., 2005; Weiss et al., 2008; Gill, 2011; Motz et al., 2012). In STS, the unsaturated subsoil beneath the soil trench and above the water table can be defined as the overall treatment system (Gill et al., 2009). In clay soils (which are not suitable for infiltration) the STS can be constructed using imported sand. The wastewater then has to be drained out at the bottom of the system and piped to a surface recipient.

Phosphorus removal in STS is attributed to chemical precipitation and sorption processes in the soil matrix. Formation of Al(III) and Fe(III) (hydr)oxide surface complexes or precipitation of Al(III), Fe(III) and/or Ca phosphates are all possible attenuation mechanisms (Robertson, 2003; Eveborn et al., 2012). In addition Fe(II) precipitates may form at low redox potential (Zanini et al., 1998).

From a recipient perspective it has been shown that OWT systems can be a significant factor for the P status of freshwaters under certain conditions (Macintosh et al., 2011; Withers et al., 2011); these authors suggested that the observed impacts are attributed to poor design or insufficient maintenance of the treatment systems rather than general leakage. However, in the scientific literature there has been observations of both high, variable and low P removal (e.g. Carroll et al., 2006; Lowe & Siegrist, 2008; Robertson, 2008; Eveborn et al., 2012; Robertson, 2012).

As support within management of decentralized wastewater sources, knowledge regarding long term P removal in STS and the P immobilization/mobilization mechanisms involved is important. Eneborn et al. (2012) used a mass balance approach to assess the P removal capacity of the unsaturated subsoil in a Swedish STS. The study gave evidence for a very poor P removal (~12%), but was limited to four sites with comparably high P loads. The aim of this study was to explore the validity of the results by performing additional (simplified) mass balance calculations and investigate both accumulation and mobility of P in the unsaturated subsoil of old STS. Specific aims were to:

1. Investigate the overall removal capacity in the unsaturated subsoil of the systems by calculating the amount of accumulated P.
2. Study the P leaching and P removal potential of soil materials from STS through pilot scale column experiments with reconstructed bed profiles.
3. Investigate the mechanisms behind the observed P retention and P release by evaluation of data from batch experiments and physical/chemical characterization (including X-ray absorption near edge structure (XANES) measurements).

2 Materials and Methods

2.1 Investigated sites

Six STS located in various parts of Sweden were investigated: Tullingsås (Tu) near Östersund N 63° 49.17', E 15° 31.09', Biverud/Glanshammar (Gl) near Örebro N 59° 19.95', E 15° 27.90', Knivingaryd (Kn) near Nybro N 56° 54.45', E 15° 57.44', Luvehult (Lu) near Nybro N 56° 52.59', E 16° 6.95', Ringamåla (Ri) near Karlshamn N 56° 21.94', E 14° 44.26' and Halahult (Ha) near Karlshamn N 56° 14.05', E 14° 58.06'. Among these sites Lu and Gl were

traditional single-household systems whereas the other ones served between 40 and about 200 persons each (Table 1). The age of the sites varied between 11 and 28 years, the hydraulic load was between 0.9 and 33 cm d⁻¹ and the estimated P load was between 30 and 540 g m⁻² yr⁻¹ (Table 1). At the Kn site a lined pond (open to the air) was used as a pre-treatment step for particle removal while at all other sites septic tanks or similar sludge removal devices were used. The Tu, Ri and Ha sites were all constructed using parallel beds, which were loaded periodically. The areas of the beds were between 30 and 196 m² (Table 1) and the soils used were imported from local gravel pits. The pre-treated wastewater was distributed to the soil through conventional drainage distribution pipes. However, the Tu and Ha sites were constructed with infiltration surfaces open to the air (framed by an embankment). At these sites the wastewater was applied over the soil from a centred (Tu) or mobile (Ha) inflow device. The sites Tu, Gl and Lu were gravity-fed systems whereas the wastewater at the sites Kn, Ri and Ha was distributed through pumping. The wastewater was finally discharged to the groundwater (Gl, Kn and Lu sites) or to a nearby stream through a drainage collection and distribution system (Tu, Ri and Ha sites). None of the latter systems had any liners, and therefore the proportion of wastewater that is discharged through the drainage system is unclear.

2.2 Soil sampling

The STS were sampled at five different depths (where the filter bed was sufficiently deep) by collection of samples from the 0-5, 5-15, 15 – 30, 30 - 60 and 60 –100 cm layers by use of a spade (in total about 350 kg soil). Sample locations were selected as close to the wastewater source as possible. However, at the sites Ri and Lu limited accessibility prevented us to collect samples immediately adjacent to the inlet. Reference samples were also collected at each site, which represented filter bed material that had not been exposed to P-containing

wastewater. At sites where imported sand was used (Ha, Kn, Tu, Ri) one single reference sample from unused sand was used. However at the other sites, 2 (Lu) or 5 (Gl) reference samples were selected to be able to consider vertical heterogeneity in soil properties. Reference samples were collected above the distribution level. Where this was not possible (Lu 60-100, Gl 0-30, and Gl 30-100) offset samples were collected (offset >2 m). The dry bulk density was determined by collection of undisturbed soil cores (by use of metal cylinders) in four replicates. The cores were dried at 105°C before weighing. At all STS soil sampling was performed at one single location. After collection, all soil samples were placed in plastic bags and stored in an isolated room protected from freezing ($T < 12^{\circ}\text{C}$) prior to further use.

2.3 Soil analyses

Samples larger than 15 kg (all samples excluding reference samples) were homogenized in a concrete mixer (for at least 15 minutes) before collection of subsamples of volumes relevant for soil analyses. The subsamples were then stored at 4°C. Field-moist samples from the 0-5 and 5-15 cm depths as well as the reference samples were analyzed for pH in deionized water (using a liquid to solid ratio of 2) with a combination electrode and a PHM93 Reference pH Meter (Radiometer A/S, Brønshøj, Denmark). Total C was determined for all samples (dried at 105°C) using a LECO CNS-2000 Analyzer. Samples for total P analysis were delivered to the laboratory at ALS Scandinavia AB in Luleå, Sweden, and analysed according to EPA methods (modified) 200.7 (ICP-AES) and 200.8 (ICP-QMS). This method was also used for elemental analysis of reference samples and included the elements Al, Fe, Ca, Mg, Mn, K and Si. Briefly, the soil samples were dried at 105°C and subsequently 0.1 g dried sample was melted with 0.375 g LiBO_2 and dissolved in HNO_3 . The loss of ignition was determined at 1000 °C.

Reactive aluminium and iron (hydr)oxides, as well as phosphorus associated with these fractions, were determined by extraction with ammonium oxalate (0.2 M oxalate buffer, pH 3) (van Reeuwijk, 1995). However, apart from P associated with aluminium and iron (hydr)oxides, other P species that are unstable at low pH will also be dissolved by this extract (e.g. calcium phosphates). Field-moist samples (in duplicates) from the six sites were extracted using a liquid to solid ratio of 100:1, shaken for 4 hours in the dark in an end-over-end shaker. Oxalate-extracted Fe, Al and P were determined with inductively coupled plasma emission spectrometry (ICP-OES) using a Perkin-Elmer Optima 3000 DV instrument.

2.4 Batch experiments

For the reference samples and for the 0-15 and 5-15 cm samples from the sites Lu, Kn, Ri and Tu, further analysis were made through batch experiments. These sites varied in terms of loading history as well as in basic chemical and physical properties and were selected also for the column experiment. Sorption properties were studied through equilibration (5 days shaking time at 21°C) of 4 g soil in 30 ml phosphate solutions (NaH_2PO_4) of the following initial P concentrations: 0, 0.02, 0.05, 0.1, 0.15, 0.2, 0.3 and 0.5 mM. 10 mM NaNO_3 was used as a background electrolyte. Another batch experiment was performed to study the pH dependence of P desorption. This experiment was set up in an identical manner but with additions of NaOH (0.5 mM) or HNO_3 (0.5, 1, 2, and 3 mM) instead of P.

In both experiments the equilibrations were set up in duplicate. After the equilibration the samples were centrifuged and the pH value was determined on the unfiltered supernatant immediately after centrifugation. Subsequently the supernatant was filtered through a 0.2 μm Acrodisc® PF filter and the inorganic $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$ concentration was determined colorimetrically

with the acid molybdate method using flow injection analysis (Aquatec-Tecator autoanalyser, Foss Analytical, Copenhagen).

2.5 Column experiments

To investigate the P discharge from old or decommissioned STS (at 1 m depth) a column experiment was set up with reconstructed bed profiles. In the experiments, columns were loaded either with a reference material (silica sand, SiO₂ content 99,8 %) or with wastewater-loaded soils from four sites (Tu, Lu, Kn and Ri). The columns were 0.3 m in diameter, the experiment was reproduced in duplicate and soil columns prepared so that they reached a final depth of the subsoil equivalent to 1 m (Fig. 1). For the Ri columns where the depth of the real STS was less than 1 m, additional soil sampled from the bottom layer was added to reach a depth of 1 m soil in the column. Distribution and draining layers (height ~0.15 m) of macadam (16-32 mm) were put at the top and at the bottom of the columns, and a piece of geotextile was used to separate the subsoil from the drainage layer (Fig. 1 (a)). The leachate was collected in polyethylene containers (40 L) which were arranged so that they could be weighed *in situ*.

During the first 12 weeks of the experiment, the columns were fed with domestic wastewater (from a community with about 2500 inhabitants). A mechanical treatment (2 mm drum screen) was applied before transfer to a 1 m³ buffer tank. The columns were fed from the buffer tank (Fig. 1 (b)), which was completely refilled with fresh wastewater once a week. The hydraulic loading rate was adapted to the design hydraulic loading rates given in the Swedish guidelines (Swedish EPA, 2003), which implies a value between 3 and 6 cm d⁻¹ depending on the grain size distribution of the soil (Fig. 1 (b)). The columns were fed intermittently with 3 hours interval. Detailed characterisation of the influent wastewater

quality was performed at weeks 1, 5 and 9 through spot-checks directly from the buffer tank. The samples were analysed at the laboratory at Uppsala Vatten och Avfall AB, Uppsala, Sweden, according to standardised methods (Table S1, supporting information). In short, the concentration of BOD, $\text{NH}_4\text{-N}$ and alkalinity varied between 120 and 160, 42 and 50 and 517 and 569 mgL^{-1} respectively (Table S1). Effluent water from each sample container (including untreated wastewater, see Fig. 1 (b)) was weighed (in order to follow mass flows) and sampled regularly (typically once a week) for analysis of pH and total P. At week 5 and 9 (24 hours after characterization of the influent wastewater) also BOD_7 , $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$, $\text{NH}_4\text{-N}$, $\text{NO}_3\text{+NO}_2\text{-N}$ and $\text{NO}_2\text{-N}$ were determined in the leachate. The pH value was determined instantly after collection with a combination electrode and a PHM93 Reference pH Meter (Radiometer A/S, Brønshøj, Denmark). Samples for BOD_7 analysis were instantly delivered and analysed at the laboratory at Uppsala Vatten och Avfall AB according to international standards (ISO 5815:1989). An additional sample volume was frozen (-18°C) for later analysis of remaining parameters. Inorganic forms of nitrogen were analysed using flow injection analysis (FIA, Aquatec-Tecator autoanalyser, Foss Analytical, Copenhagen, Denmark). $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$ was determined as for the batch experiments and for total P unfiltered samples were first digested in acid potassium persulfate solution before subsequent analysis.

After the end of the first column experiment, the buffer tank was cleaned and filled with deionized water. An identical column experiment (but with deionized water instead of wastewater) was then started. This experiment was carried out for a period of 9 weeks. The buffer tank was recharged with fresh deionized water every third week. The hydraulic loading scheme, as well as the sampling scheme, was identical to that of the first experiment with wastewater (Fig. 1 (b)). However, characterization of effluent water was performed at week 5 and 9 and included (in addition to total P and pH) only $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$. Analyses were conducted as

above. As a consequence of hydraulic failure (clogging) in the reference columns at the beginning of the deionized water experiment, the ref 1 and ref 2 columns had to be run with a decreased loading rate. The ref 2 column even had to be closed for most part of the experiment. However there was always sufficient leachate available for sampling.

2.6 XANES analysis

Soil samples from the 5-15 cm layer of the Lu, Ha and Tu site (dried at 105°C and ground in a mineral grinder) were mounted on caption tape and analysed using P *K*-edge XANES spectroscopy on beamline BL8 of the Synchrotron Light Research Institute, Thailand (Klysubun et al., 2012). The beamline were operated in fluorescence mode and the fluorescence signal was measured using an solid state Ge detector. The scans ranged from 2100 to 2320 eV with a smaller energy step near the absorption edge (down to 0.2 eV between 2144-2153eV). The counting time was constantly 3 s. Between 3 and 9 scans per each sample were collected depending on the level of noise in the data, and subsequently merged.

The XANES data processing was performed by means of the Athena program in the Demeter Software Package (v 0.9.18) (Ravel & Newville, 2005). All samples and standards were calibrated to a common energy scale by setting the maximum of the first derivative of the spectrum of variscite to 2149.0 eV. Correction of any shifts on energy scale caused by monochromator drift could be performed since validation data for variscite periodically were collected. Merged spectra were normalized using a consistent procedure. In brief, a linear baseline function was subtracted from the spectral region below the edge (typically between -45 to -6 eV relative to E_0), and spectra were normalized to unit edge step and quadrature

removed across the post-white-line region (typically between 26 to 170 eV relative to E_0) to obtain normalized XANES spectra.

By means of a linear combination fitting (LCF) approach (Tannazi & Bunker, 2005) a set of spectra of known standards were combined and fitted to the sample spectra. All standards used in the evaluation have been characterized by XRD (Eriksson et.al., manuscript in preparation), and XANES data were collected at the same beamline as the samples. The standard compounds included amorphous calcium phosphate, octacalcium phosphate, hydroxyapatite, brushite, monetite, amorphous aluminium phosphate, phosphorus adsorbed to aluminium hydroxide, variscite, amorphous iron phosphate, phosphorus adsorbed to ferrihydrite, strengite, struvite, potassium tarankite, lecithin and phytate. In the fitting procedure no energy shifts were permitted and the sum of the weighting factors were not forced to one. With support from earlier studies (Eveborn et al., 2009), the first derivative was chosen as the fitting space. At most three standards were accepted in each fit and the fitting range was constrained to between -5 to 30 eV relative to E_0 .

3 Results

3.1 Characterization of reference soils

According to element analyses there were no dramatic differences in the elemental composition of the soil between the six sites (Table S2). The somewhat higher Ca content at the sites Ri and Ha (17 and 30 mg g⁻¹ dw⁻¹ compared to around 10 mg g⁻¹ for the other sites) coincides with a higher pH value (around 8.9 for Ri and Ha compared to between 5.9 and 6.8 for the other sites). This may be caused by the presence of calcite (CaCO₃) at the Ri and Ha sites. The initial P content ranged from 0.15 to 0.31 mg g⁻¹. Between 6 and 100 % of the total

P was oxalate-extractable (Table S2). According to the grain size distribution analysis the GD_{50} values for the soils ranged from 0.21 to 3.93 mm.

3.2 Phosphorus accumulation and correlation to soil properties

The amount of accumulated P (calculated as the difference between total P in a sample and total P in the corresponding reference sample) typically varied between 0.15 and 0.6 mg g⁻¹ (Fig. 2 and Fig. S1). However, the Lu site showed evidence for stronger (up to 1.2 mg g⁻¹) P accumulation (Fig. 2). An even stronger P accumulation (2.28 mg g⁻¹) was observed for the Tu 0-5 sample. However, this result was associated with an extreme (and abnormal) amount of organic content (Fig. S1) and this particular layer visually resembled sewage sludge.

A distinct relationship between oxalate-extractable P and oxalate-extractable Al was observed for wastewater loaded samples ($r^2 = 0.92$, $p < 0.001$), whereas the correlation between oxalate-extractable P and oxalate-extractable Fe was much weaker ($r^2 = 0.6$).

As evidenced by the pH-dependence experiment, the solubility of the bound P was generally lowest at pH values ranging from 4 to 6 (for the Kn, Lu, Ri and Tu soils, see Fig. S2). All sites showed an increasing P solubility when the pH value was decreased further (pH < 4). Except for the Tu site (for which no high-pH data were available), an increased P solubility was observed at higher pH starting at pH 5.5 for Lu and at around 6 for the sites Kn and Ri.

If the layer thickness and the density of the soil are considered, the total P accumulation on a volume basis in each bed can be summed up to 0.32, 0.32, 0.46, 0.66, 0.73 and 0.87 kg m⁻³ for the Gl, Ri, Ha, Kn, Tu and Lu sites respectively (Fig. 3). Among the studied sites no relationship could be established between the estimated P load and the amount of accumulated P (Fig. 3).

3.3 XANES Analysis

Of the 15 standard compounds included in the evaluation, 8 standards (Fig. 4 (a)) were represented in any of the ten best fits at weights above 10 % (Table 2). In both the Ha, Lu and Tu samples the XANES analysis indicated significant amounts of P bound as amorphous aluminium phosphates or as P adsorbed onto aluminium (hydr)oxide surfaces. The best fits resulted in weights between 24 and 62% of these phases (Table 2, Fig. 4 (b)). Organically bound phosphates were also well represented in all analyses (weights between 35 and 43%). Evidence for the importance of calcium phosphates was found only in the Ha sample where calcium phosphates predominated with 43% weight in the best fit (Table 2, Fig. 4 (b)).

For the best fits (Fig. 4 (b)) the Athena software reported R factors between 0.022 and 0.045. In general the distribution of P between Al, Ca and organically bound P was stable among the 10 best fits (Table 2). The differences between the fitting results from the Lu site was caused by a small amount (weight less than 10%) of a third component, the identity of which differed in the fits. The weight of iron phosphates never exceeded 16% at any site.

3.4 Soil properties as affected by wastewater

When comparing reference samples and wastewater-loaded samples, several differences in soil properties were observed. In the wastewater-loaded samples, the pH of the top layer was typically between 1 and 2 pH units lower than in the reference samples. Further, oxalate-extractable metals had increased considerably in the deeper layers at many sites (Fig. 2, Fig. S1). However, there were no distinct patterns in the depth distributions of oxalate extractable metals (Fig. S1). The sorption experiment revealed that for the Lu site, the sorption capacity was higher in reference samples than in wastewater loaded samples (Fig. S3). In fact, the opposite was true for the Tu site while no significant differences were observed at the Kn and

Ri sites. According to the sorption data of the reference samples, the soils at the Tu and Lu sites were superior to the Kn and Ri sites in terms of the P removal capacity (Fig. S3). At an equilibrium concentration of 1 mg P L^{-1} the Lu and Tu reference samples both removed more than 50 mg P kg^{-1} whereas the Kn and Ri sites removed less than 30 mg kg^{-1} . However, as evidenced from the mass balance calculations, the Tu, Lu, Kn and Ri sites had removed between 213 and 680 mg P kg^{-1} . Thus, the laboratory-established P removal capacities were about an order of magnitude lower than those obtained through mass balances.

3.5 Phosphorus leaching in the column experiment with wastewater

After five weeks of wastewater load biological processes in the columns were active and performed well in terms of nitrification and organic degradation. More than 97 % of the N ($\text{NO}_3\text{-N} + \text{NO}_2 + \text{NH}_4\text{-N}$) was present as NO_3 and the BOD concentrations were below the detection limit of 3 mg L^{-1} (data not shown). In week 9 the results indicated 100% nitrification and the reduction of BOD was still complete. The fraction of total P that was inorganic $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$ (as evidenced by the acid molybdate method), varied between 13 and 80 % with a mean value of 50 % (data not shown).

The total P concentrations were generally low in the effluent waters during wastewater load (Fig. 5). The Kn and Ri sites had relatively weak P removal (the effluent P concentrations ranged from 0.8 to 3 mg L^{-1} , which corresponded to between 74 and 85 % P removal on mass basis). By contrast the Lu and Tu sites had very strong P removal, with effluent P concentrations always being $<0.3 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$, corresponding to 97 % P removal (Fig. 5). For the silica reference a small and relatively constant P removal (18 % on mass basis) was observed and the effluent concentrations varied between 3 and 5 mg L^{-1} (Fig. 5). The amount of P

accumulated during the loading period was around 8.3 mg P kg^{-1} for the Lu and Ri sites and around 9.6 mg P kg^{-1} for the Kn and Tu sites.

The pH value in the effluent was variable (Fig. S4). The Ri and Silica reference columns were following the pH of the influent wastewater closely (around pH 8), whereas the other sites generally had a lower and more variable pH (5.7- 7.7). The Kn site had a rising pH trend (from about pH 7 to pH 7.7) during the experiment and was approaching the pH value of the influent wastewater. However, the Lu and Tu sites did not follow any distinct pattern and the pH varied between 5.7 and 7.7.

3.6 Phosphorus leaching in the column experiment with deionized water

When the influent to the columns was shifted from wastewater to deionized water a dramatic colour shift occurred in the effluent, i.e. from transparent and clear to yellowish or brownish with high turbidity. However, this observation did not bring about a consistently different PO_4 : total P ratio. The concentration of dissolved PO_4 -P in the effluent was in the range from 20 to 80 % of the total P with a mean value of around 50 %, i.e. similar as in the first column experiment with wastewater. The P concentration in the effluent varied between the different sites, but effluent P concentrations were consistently higher than during wastewater load (Fig. 5). The Kn columns generally had the highest effluent P concentrations which were initially up to 6 mg L^{-1} (Fig. 4). After week 4 the Kn column effluent concentrations stabilized at around 3 mg L^{-1} . The silica reference columns and the Ri site columns followed a similar pattern with initially high effluent P concentrations (up to 4 and 3 mg L^{-1} respectively) and then the P concentrations decreased to about 2 mg L^{-1} at the end of the experiment (Fig. 4). The P leaching patterns for the Ri and Lu site columns were different and the P discharge from these columns were significantly lower. In the latter two columns the dissolved P

concentration was quite stable from week 6 onwards, with dissolved P ranging from about 1 to 1.5 mg L⁻¹ (Fig. 4).

The shift from wastewater to deionized water generally resulted in a pH increase in the effluent waters except for the Ri site columns and the silica reference columns, for which pH value decreased a little (Fig. S5). At the end of the experiment the pH value in all columns ranged from 6.7 to 7.7.

4 Discussion

The decrease in soil pH and the increase in oxalate-extractable metals that we observed (Fig. 2, Fig. S1) is consistent with other studies (Robertson, 2003; Eveborn et al., 2012). In most cases (neutral to strongly acid soils) a pH decrease will probably favour the P removal, as sorption and precipitation processes that involve iron and aluminium (hydr)oxides are usually more efficient at low pH. According to the pH-dependence results (Fig. S2), the lower pH limit (below which P solubility rapidly increases) are between pH 3.5 and 4. In calcareous soils the pH decrease might prevent the formation of calcium phosphates as these precipitation processes is most effective at pH >9 (Eveborn et al., 2009).

The increasing levels of oxalate extractable aluminium and iron over time (Fig. 2, Fig. S1) may enhance the P removal. It is likely that both precipitation of aluminium phosphates and surface complexation reactions occur. As concluded earlier (Eveborn et al., 2012), the P to Al ratio in the oxalate extract is larger (0.73 according to linear regression of oxalate-P vs. oxalate-Al) than would be expected if surface complexation reactions alone would be responsible for the P removal. The XANES analysis confirms the importance of aluminium chemistry (Table 2) but the spectral differences between amorphous aluminium phosphates and phosphorus adsorbed to aluminium (hydr)oxides is small (Fig. 4 (a)). Thus, it is not

evident that any of these two mechanisms predominates at any of the sites. Aluminium-rich P phases have been identified as important sinks for P in similar environments (Zanini et al., 1998; Arai & Livi, 2013). According to the XANES analysis (Table 2), even organic P may play an important role in the P accumulation. However, the long term stability of this P pool is unclear. Degradation of the organic substances will result in the release of mineralized P.

Several mechanisms have been proposed that may cause the transfer of surface-bound P into stable P pools (Robertson, 2008), which may in the long run increase the P sorption capacity of soils. In this study we observed clear discrepancies (up to over tenfold) between laboratory sorption data on reference samples and the long term P accumulation in the field (based on mass balances). Changes in pH and in oxalate-extractable metals during the wastewater load can partly explain these discrepancies and therefore the results do not necessarily imply that any P will be immobilized into inactive, “insoluble” forms. In fact Lookman et al. (1995) found that all oxalate- extractable P was reversibly fixed in a selection of acid sandy soils ($3.9 < \text{pH}_{\text{KCL}} < 5.7$).

It is clear from our P load estimates and P accumulation calculations that the P removal capacity in the subsoil can be easily exceeded. From this we can conclude that the long term performance of STS are much dependent on the wastewater load. Let us assume that the phosphate concentration in a septic tank effluent is on average 10 mg L^{-1} , that the long term hydraulic loading rate is 0.6 cm d^{-1} and that the available soil volume for treatment in the unsaturated subsoil is 1 m^3 per meter of drainage tube. In such a scenario (close to that of Robertson (2012)), the STS studied here will theoretically (as estimated from mass balance) be able to accumulate P during 15 to 40 years of wastewater load, the exact value depending on the soil properties (Fig. 3). However, if the hydraulic loading rate is increased to 3 cm d^{-1} (close to the maximum load according to USEPA guidelines, but still common with Swedish

design specifications) the time it takes to saturate the system will decrease to between 3 and 8 years. Accordingly, the hydraulic loading rate is crucial for the P mass balance calculations.

We expected poor P removal when the already overloaded soil (according to P mass balances) was subject to further wastewater application but the results were contradictory (Fig. 5). The P discharge during the experiment was even lower than that reported from several short-term field studies (Nilsson & Stuanes, 1987; Aaltonen & Andersson, 1996; Nilsson et al., 1998). Accordingly, the results obtained do not seem to reflect the actual P leakage from old and heavily loaded STS. One possible explanation to the contradictory behavior could be that the collected soil layers were mixed (separately) during the setup of column replicates. This homogenization procedure may eventually expose new or hidden sorption or precipitation agents in the soil and eliminate macro pore pathways that might be present in an undisturbed soil profile.

The release pattern observed during the deionized water load is not fully understood. It is surprising that much higher concentrations of P were found in the leachate during deionized water load than during wastewater load (Fig. 5). Zurawsky et al. (2004) partly explained similar observations (leachate concentrations up to 9 mg L^{-1}) from subsoils of STS by reductive dissolution of Fe-P phases. However, according to the XANES analysis, iron phosphates were not present to any considerable extent in the studied soils and the Fe concentrations in the leachate during wastewater load were usually very low ($< 0.25 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$; data not shown). The evidence for substantial amounts of aluminium phosphates in the soil (Table 2) indicates that dissolution of these compounds is a possible P release mechanism. However, the P concentrations in the leachate were unreasonably high to be explained only through this mechanism. We hypothesize that the dramatic shift in ionic strength might destabilize particulate material and increase the mobilization of non-reactive P. A substantial

part of the P is organically bound (Table 2) and may be a source for such mobile forms of P. Destabilization mechanisms has been proved to be important elsewhere (Laegdsmand et al., 2005). Although no significant changes in the ratio of $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$:total P could be observed in the experiments (when comparing data from the periods of deionized water load and wastewater load) this hypothesis might still be possible.

The result from the column study using deionized water load, indicates that certain STS bed material cause substantial wash-out of P. The P wash-out could be caused by e.g. ground water inflow, diluted wastewater application or long-term drainage after decommissioning. However, the sites Lu and Tu, which had the highest oxalate extractable aluminium contents (Fig. 2 and Fig. S1), showed much less P discharge during both wastewater application and deionized water application (Fig. 4) in comparison to the other sites. These observations emphasize the role of aluminium chemistry for efficient P removal and are supported by other desorption studies on acid sandy soils (Lookman et al., 1995). The findings also show that despite favourable conditions for strong P fixation, significant amounts of P can be released. In terms of groundwater quality even a discharge of 1 mg P L^{-1} is substantial. Hinsby et al. (2008) suggested 0.08 mg P L^{-1} as threshold value for P in Danish ground water systems (for the protection of dependent ecosystems).

5 Conclusion

- Phosphorus removal in the unsaturated subsoil of STS is limited, and the risk for P leakage will be dependent on the long term magnitude of the P load. Thus, STS in close proximity to water bodies will pose a risk for significant P leakage.

- It is not safe to assume that P accumulated in STS is immobilized irreversibly. The vulnerability to wash-out of P through groundwater through-flow or atmospheric precipitation could be high.
- In the investigated sandy soils both the P accumulation and the vulnerability to wash-out are correlated to the amount of oxalate-extractable Al. In the most P-retaining STS P is accumulated mainly as aluminium phosphates or as P associated with aluminium oxyhydroxide surfaces, although organically bound P was also an important phase according to the XANES analysis.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge Mirsada Kulenovic and her colleagues at the department of Soil and Environment at the Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences in Uppsala, Agnieszka Renman, KTH and Wantana Klysubun, SLRI for technical support. We are also thankful to the municipalities of Nybro, Karlshamn and Krokomb as well as to Lars Eveborn and Thomas Molin (private homeowners) who put their treatment systems at our disposal. Thanks to The Swedish Agency for Marine and Water Management and to The Swedish Research Council Formas (project no. 2006-632) for financial support of this research.

References

- Aaltonen, J. & Andersson, P., (1996) Durability and maintenance of ecotechnological wastewater systems, In: Ecotechnics for a sustainable society: proceedings from Ecotechnics 95: international symposium on ecological engineering. Östersund, Sweden., pp. 117–137.
- Arai, Y. & Livi, K. J., (2013) Underassessed phosphorus fixation mechanisms in soil sand fraction. *GEODERMA* 192: 422–429.

- 453 Beal, C. D., Gardner, E. A., & Menzies, N. W., (2005) Process, performance, and pollution
454 potential: A review of septic tank-soil absorption systems. AUSTRALIAN
455 JOURNAL OF SOIL RESEARCH 43(7): 781–802.
- 456 Boesch, D., Hecky, R., Chair, C. O', Schindler, D., & Seitzinger, S., (2006) *Eutrophication*
457 *of swedish seas* (Report 5509). Swedish Environmental Protection Agency,
458 Stockholm, Sweden.
- 459 Brandt, M., Ejhed, H., & Rapp, L., (2009) *Nutrient loads to the Swedish marine environment*
460 *in 2006 - Sweden's Report for HELCOM's Fifth Pollution Load Compilation* (Report
461 5995). Swedish Environmental Protection Agency, Stockholm, Sweden.
- 462 Butler, D. & Payne, J., (1995) Septic tanks: Problems and practice. BUILDING AND
463 ENVIRONMENT 30(3): 419–425.
- 464 Bylund, S., (2003) *Study of the functionality and treatment performance in open infiltration*
465 *systems (Studie av funktion och reningsresultat i öppna filterbäddar)* (Report 2003-
466 12). Swedish Water & Wastewater Association, Stockholm, Sweden. In Swedish.
- 467 Carroll, S., Goonetilleke, A., Khalil, W. A. S., & Frost, R., (2006) Assessment via
468 discriminant analysis of soil suitability for effluent renovation using undisturbed soil
469 columns. GEODERMA 131(1): 201–217.
- 470 Eveborn, D., Gustafsson, J., Hesterberg, D., & Hillier, S., (2009) XANES Speciation of P in
471 Environmental Samples: An Assessment of Filter Media for on-Site Wastewater
472 Treatment. ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE & TECHNOLOGY 43(17): 6515–6521.
- 473 Eveborn, D., Gustafsson, J. P., & Kong, D., (2012) Wastewater treatment by soil infiltration:
474 long-term phosphorus removal. JOURNAL OF CONTAMINANT HYDROLOGY
475 (140): 24–33.
- 476 Gill, L. W., (2011) The development of a Code of Practice for single house on-site
477 wastewater treatment in Ireland. WATER SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY 64(3):
478 677–683.
- 479 Gill, L. W., O'Luanaigh, N., Johnston, P. M., Misstear, B. D. R., & O'Suilleabhain, C.,
480 (2009) Nutrient loading on subsoils from on-site wastewater effluent, comparing
481 septic tank and secondary treatment systems. WATER RESEARCH 43(10): 2739–
482 2749.
- 483 Hinsby, K., Condesso de Melo, M. T., & Dahl, M., (2008) European case studies supporting
484 the derivation of natural background levels and groundwater threshold values for the
485 protection of dependent ecosystems and human health. SCIENCE OF THE TOTAL
486 ENVIRONMENT 401(1–3): 1–20.
- 487 Jönsson, H., Baky, A., Jeppson, U., Hellström, D., & Kärrman, E., (2005) *Composition of*
488 *urine, faeces, greywater and bio-waste - for utilisation in the URWARE model.*
489 Chalmers University Of Technology, Gothenburg, Sweden.

- 490 Klysubun, W., Sombunchoo, P., Deenan, W., & Kongmark, C., (2012) Performance and
491 status of beamline BL8 at SLRI for X-ray absorption spectroscopy. JOURNAL OF
492 SYNCHROTRON RADIATION 19: 930–936.
- 493 Laegdsmand, M., de Jonge, L. W., & Moldrup, P., (2005) Leaching of colloids and dissolved
494 organic matter from columns packed with natural soil aggregates. SOIL SCIENCE
495 170(1): 13–27.
- 496 Lookman, R., Freese, D., Merckx, R., Vlassak, K., & van Riemsdijk, W. H., (1995) Long-
497 Term Kinetics of Phosphate Release from Soil. ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE &
498 TECHNOLOGY 29(6): 1569–1575.
- 499 Lowe, K. & Siegrist, R., (2008) Controlled field experiment for performance evaluation of
500 septic tank effluent treatment during soil infiltration. JOURNAL OF
501 ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING-ASCE 134(2): 93–101.
- 502 Macintosh, K. A., Jordan, P., Cassidy, R., Arnscheidt, J., & Ward, C., (2011) Low flow water
503 quality in rivers; septic tank systems and high-resolution phosphorus signals.
504 SCIENCE OF THE TOTAL ENVIRONMENT 412: 58–65.
- 505 Motz, E., Cey, E., Ryan, M., & Chu, A., (2012) Nutrient Fate and Transport in the Vadose
506 Zone below an At-Grade Wastewater Distribution System in a Cold Climate.
507 JOURNAL OF ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING 138(10): 1029–1039.
- 508 Nilsson, P., Nyberg, F., & Karlsson, M., (1998) *The performance of filter bed systems, control
509 and evaluation of drained soil treatment systems (Markbäddars funktion, kontroll och
510 utvärdering av markbäddar)*. Swedish EPA, Stockholm, Sweden. In Swedish.
- 511 Nilsson, P. & Stuanes, A. O., (1987) Investigation of soil treatment systems for septic tank
512 effluent. 1. Design, function, hydraulic properties, input and output. VATTEN 43(1):
513 26–37.
- 514 Ravel, B. & Newville, M., (2005) ATHENA, ARTEMIS, HEPHAESTUS: data analysis for
515 X-ray absorption spectroscopy using IFEFFIT. JOURNAL OF SYNCHROTRON
516 RADIATION 12: 537–541.
- 517 Van Reeuwijk, L. P., (1995) *Procedures for soil analyses, 5th ed.*, International Soil
518 Reference and Information Centre, Wageningen, Netherlands.
- 519 Robertson, W. D., (2003) Enhanced attenuation of septic system phosphate in noncalcareous
520 sediments. GROUND WATER 41(1): 48–56.
- 521 Robertson, W. D., (2008) Irreversible phosphorus sorption in septic system plumes?
522 GROUND WATER 46(1): 51–60.
- 523 Robertson, W. D., (2012) Phosphorus Retention in a 20-Year-Old Septic System Filter Bed.
524 JOURNAL OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY 41(5): 1437–1444.
- 525 Smith, R. V., Jordan, C., & Annett, J. A., (2005) A phosphorus budget for Northern Ireland:
526 inputs to inland and coastal waters. JOURNAL OF HYDROLOGY 304(1–4): 193–
527 202.

528 Smith, V. H., (2003) Eutrophication of freshwater and coastal marine ecosystems - A global
529 problem. ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE AND POLLUTION RESEARCH 10(2):
530 126–139.

531 Swedish EPA, (2003) *Små avloppsanläggningar : hushållsspillvatten från högst 5 hushåll*,
532 Swedish EPA, Stockholm, Sweden.

533 Tannazi, F. & Bunker, G., (2005) Determination of chemical speciation by XAFS. PHYSICA
534 SCRIPTA 115: 953–956.

535 USEPA, (2002) *Onsite Wastewater Treatment Systems Manual*. U.S. Environmental
536 Protection Agency, Washington, DC.

537 Weiss, P., Eveborn, D., Kärrman, E., & Gustafsson, J. P., (2008) Environmental systems
538 analysis of four on-site wastewater treatment options. RESOURCES,
539 CONSERVATION AND RECYCLING 52: 1153–1161.

540 Withers, P. J. A., Jarvie, H. P., & Stoate, C., (2011) Quantifying the impact of septic tank
541 systems on eutrophication risk in rural headwaters. ENVIRONMENT
542 INTERNATIONAL 37(3): 644–653.

543 Wulff, F., Savchuk, O. P., Sokolov, A., Humborg, C., & Morth, C.-M., (2007) Management
544 options and effects on a marine ecosystem: Assessing the future of the Baltic.
545 AMBIO 36(2-3): 243–249.

546 Zanini, L., Robertson, W. D., Ptacek, C. J., Schiff, S. L., & Mayer, T., (1998) Phosphorus
547 characterization in sediments impacted by septic effluent at four sites in central
548 Canada. JOURNAL OF CONTAMINANT HYDROLOGY 33(3–4): 405–429.

549 Zurawsky, M. A., Robertson, W. D., Ptacek, C. J., & Schiff, S. L., (2004) Geochemical
550 stability of phosphorus solids below septic system infiltration beds. JOURNAL OF
551 CONTAMINANT HYDROLOGY 73(1–4): 129–143.

552

553

Figure 1. Layout of columns and sample containers (a) and schematic view over the column experiment including soils and loading rates (b).

a) Ri site

b) Lu site

Figure 2. Depth distribution of different soil properties for samples and reference samples at a) site Ri and b) site Lu.

557 Figure 3. P accumulation at the studied sites in relation to the estimated P load. P load
 558 estimations and the basis for these are given in Table 1.

559

Figure 4. Spectra for standards represented (with weights>10%) in the 10 best linear combination fits for the samples (a) and overlaid plots of sample data and the best (lowest R-factor) linear combination fits (b).

Figure 5. Total P concentrations in inflowing water and leachates from the Tu site column replicates (Tu 1, Tu 2), Lu sites column replicates (Lu 1, Lu 2), Kn site column replicates (Kn 1, Kn 2), Ri sites column replicates (Ri 1, Ri 2) and silica reference replicates (Ref 1, Ref 2) during 12 weeks of wastewater water load (W1-W12) and 9 weeks of deionized water load (D1-D9).

Table 1. Description of studied soil treatment systems

	Tu	Gl	Lu	Kn	Ri	Ha
Design base (pe)	225	5	5	75	150	100
Connected (pe)	n.a.	6	4	40	n.a.	n.a.
Surface area(s) (m²)	2x196	30	50	80	2x160	2x50
Hydraulic load^a (cm d⁻¹)	33	2.2	0.9	25	n.a.	30
P load (g m⁻² yr⁻¹)	370 ^c	80 ^b	30 ^b	200 ^b	n.a.	540 ^c
Age (year)	18	20	23	11	28	24
Pre treatment	Septic tank	Septic tank	Septic tank	Lined pond	Septic tank	Septic tank
Wastewater distribution	Gravity fed, open surface distribution	Gravity fed, drain field	Gravity fed, drain field	Pump fed, drain field	Pump fed, drain field	Pump fed, open surface distribution
Thickness of soil bed (m)	>1	>1	>1	0.9	0.8	0.9
Discharge	Drained to surface water	Ground-water	Ground-water	Ground-water	Drained to surface water	Drained to surface water

^a Based on annual mean flows and active infiltration areas (where several beds are shifted). Mean flows for the sites Gl, Lu and Kn have been calculated based on a water usage equivalent to 180 L person⁻¹ d⁻¹ and 60 % home attendance. Mean flows at other sites taken from Bylund (2003).

^b An estimation based on mean flows (as described above), total infiltration area and a 10 mg L⁻¹ P concentration in the wastewater (Jönsson et al., 2005).

^c Calculated from a dataset of ~50 inflow and P concentration measurements (Bylund, 2003) and total infiltration area.

571

572

Table 2. Fitting results for linear combination fit performed in first derivative space with an energy range between -5 and 30 eV. Standards represented with weights<10% not reported.

Category	Standard component	Weight, best fit	Presence in 10 best fits										Mean weight
Ha 5-15													
Al-P	Amorphous aluminium phosphate				x	x	x	x					0.29
	P adsorbed to Al(OH) ₃	0.24	x	x						x	x	x	0.21
Ca-P	Apatite				x		x				x		0.41
	Amorphous calcium phosphate	0.43	x		x		x	x	x		x	x	0.47
Organic P	Phytic Na	0.35	x	x				x	x				0.32
	Lecithin				x	x				x		x	0.27
Fe-P	P adsorbed to ferrihydrite							x		x		x	0.13
Lu 5-15													
Al-P	Amorphous aluminium phosphate	0.3	x										0.3
	P adsorbed to Al(OH) ₃	0.32	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	0.45
Organic P	Phytic Na	0.36	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	0.4
Ca-P	Monetite					x							0.11
Tu 5-15													
Al-P	Amorphous aluminium phosphate	0.28	x	x	x	x				x		x	0.37
	P adsorbed to Al(OH) ₃	0.2	x					x	x		x		0.27
Ca-P	Monetite										x	x	0.23
	Amorphous calcium phosphate							x		x	x		0.19
Organic P	Phytic Na	0.43	x	x	x			x	x	x	x	x	0.4
Fe-P	P adsorbed to ferrihydrite					x		x	x				0.11
	Strengite							x				x	0.26

Supplementary Material

Manuscript title: Phosphorus in soil treatment systems: accumulation and mobility

Authors: David Eveborn*, Jon Petter Gustafsson, Elin Elmfors, Lin Yu, Ann-Kristin Eriksson, Emelie Ljung, Gunno Renman

Pages: 8

Number of Tables: 2

Number of Figures: 5

Table S1. Characteristics of wastewater used in the column study and analytical methods utilized. All values in mg L⁻¹ (except pH).

	Week 1	Week 5	Week 9	Analytical method
BOD7	120	140	160	ISO 5815:1989
CODCr	280	280	370	Kuvette test (Dr Lange LCK814)
SS	110	90	140	EN 872:2005
Tot-N	56.1	59.5	75.3	ex- SS 028131-1 oxidation with peroxodisulphate
NH4-N	41.8	40.5	49.8	ISO 11732, flow analysis and spectrometric detection
NO2-N	0.25	0.22	0.47	ISO 6777:1984, molecular absorption spectrometric method.
NO3-N+ NO2-N	0.70	0.62	0.35	SS 028133-2 appendix A, reduction of nitrate with copperized cadmium followed by spectrophotometric detection
Tot-P	6.2	5.9	7.8	SS-EN 15681-2:2005
PO4-P	4.1	4.4	4.9	SS-EN 15681-2:2005
Fe	0.14	0.28	0.19	ISO 17294-2, ICP-MS
Al	0.62	0.60	0.72	ISO 17294-2, ICP-MS
Ca	81	89.4	132	ISO 17294-2, ICP-MS
Alk	537	517	569	ISO 9963-1:1994, acidimetric titration
TOC	85.4	61.3	84.6	SS-EN 1484 ed. 1. High temperature catalytic oxidation
pH	8.3	8.1	8.1	SS 028122-2

Table S2. Characteristics of unused soils (reference samples) at the studied sites

		GI 0-30	GI 30-100	Lu 0-60	Lu 60-100	Ri	Ha	Kn	Tu
Elemental analysis (mg/g dw ⁻¹)	Si	418	425	378	364	395	383	367	371
	Al	57	60	78	77	55	61	81	73
	Ca	10	9	8	11	17	30	10	10
	Fe	31	37	26	43	23	24	29	44
	K	22	31	41	37	30	37	41	37
	Mg	4	3	4	5	2	3	5	7
	Mn	0.44	0.49	0.50	0.67	0.35	0.37	0.57	0.65
	P	0.20	0.15	0.16	0.19	0.22	0.16	0.19	0.31
pH (in H ₂ O)		5.89	-	6.25	-	8.89	8.94	6.84	6.45
^d P _{ox} (mg/g dw ⁻¹)		0.20	-	0.07	-	0.06	0.01	0.05	0.15
GD50 (mm)		0.044 ^a	0.21 ^b	0.26 ^a	1.64 ^b	1.50	3.93	1.45	1.02
^c K sat (m/d)		0.21		24.53		20.93	90.23	25.30	7.44
Dry bulk density (kg/m ³)		1700		1300		1500	1400	1500	1600

- a) Fine grained layers in the bed
b) Coarse grained layers in the bed
c) Measured at 55 cm depth
d) P_{ox} = Oxalate extractable P

a) site Ha

b) site Gl

c) site Kn

d) site Tu

Figure S1. Depth distribution of different soil properties for samples and reference samples at *a* site Ri , *b* site Gl, *c* site Kn and *d* site Tu.

Figure S2. Solubility of $\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$ as a function of the pH obtained in solution after equilibration with acid (HNO_3) and base (NaOH) additions.

Figure S3. Sorbed (removed) P (mg P /kg soil) as a function of the equilibrium concentration of PO₄-P (mg PO₄-P/l) for layers 0-5, 5-15 and reference samples at the sites Ri, Tu, Kn and Lu. Values for the layer 0-5 at the Tu site are excluded because of its extremely large concentration of organic matter.

Figure S4. pH in influent wastewater and leachates from the Tu site column replicates (Tu 1, Tu 2), Lu sites column replicates (Lu 1, Lu 2), Kn site column replicates (Kn 1, Kn 2), Ri sites column replicates (Ri 1, Ri 2) and silica reference replicates (Ref 1, Ref 2) during 9 of 12 weeks of wastewater load.

Figure S5. pH in leachates from the Tu site column replicates (Tu 1, Tu 2), Lu sites column replicates (Lu 1, Lu 2), Kn site column replicates (Kn 1, Kn2), Ri sites column replicates (Ri 1, Ri 2) and silica reference replicates (Ref 1, Ref 2) during 9 weeks of deionized water load.